

Exploring Issues of Civil Rights in 'SSC' Versus 'O' Level Urdu Textbooks: An Analytical Study

Jamshed Iqbal ¹ Syeda Laila Saeed ² Syed Saeed ³

¹ Assistant Professor, Cambridge School, Department of English, The Fazlehaq College, Mardan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

✉ jamshediqbal@fcm.edu.pk

² Undergraduate Scholar (BS English), Government Post Graduate College for Women, Mardan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

✉ syedalailasaeed973@gmail.com

³ Department of Education, Garden Campus, Abdul Wali Khan University, Mardan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

✉ syedsaeed54@gmail.com

This article may be cited as Iqbal, J., Saeed, S. L., Saeed, S. (2025). Exploring Issues of Civil Rights in 'SSC' Versus 'O' Level Urdu Textbooks: An Analytical Study. *ProScholar Insights*, 4(4), 74-83. <https://doi.org/10.55737/psi.2025d-44126>

Abstract: The purpose of this comparative content analytical study was to investigate key issues of civil rights highlighted in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan in the textbooks of Urdu in SSC versus 'O' Level in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The research question framed for this qualitative study was to explore how far the most pressing issues of civil rights have been addressed in the selected textbooks. This research endeavor was delimited to Urdu textbooks being in vogue in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The study population comprised all lessons from both strands of the Urdu Textbooks. The researchers selected only two lessons from both streams through convenient and purposive sampling techniques. Data were collected by adopting the Model of Shukla (2011), which was analyzed through frequency and percentage. It was found that the issue of race [f= 17 having 85 %] was given more weightage in the SSC Urdu textbook, which was contrary to the 'O' level with [f= 00 having 00 %]. Conversely, the issues of gender and freedom from discrimination were found more in 'O' Level Urdu with [f= 08 with 40 % each] in contrast to SSC Textbook with [f= 00 having]. The study recommended that the key decision makers, curriculum planning wings, and the concerned textbook boards of both SSC and 'O' Level have to give due consideration to the ignored but pressing issues of civil rights to create awareness of human rights education among the learners.

Keywords: Civil Rights Issues, Urdu Textbooks, Secondary Schools Stream, 'O' Level Cambridge, Human Rights Education



Corresponding Author:

Jamshed Iqbal

Cambridge School, Department of English, The Fazlehaq College, Mardan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

✉ jamshediqbal@fcm.edu.pk

Introduction

A considerable amount of research has been devoted to the pivotal role of education in the progress of a country. Eminent researchers (e.g., Rashid et al., 2023) have an unflinching belief that education is equally considered to be an effective source in achieving success at national, regional, and world levels by any state. Both education and human rights (to be referred to as HR) have, therefore, an unshakeable proximity with each other, for it is the prime responsibility of the educational systems across the globe to enable the young generations to know about the most conspicuous role which HR plays in shaping our lives and the insuppressible vigor of the democratic governments (Quennerstedt, 2022). In other words, the concepts of democracy and HR have been gaining ground in the teaching and learning activities taking place in the arena of education (Gürel & Avcı, 2022), particularly in the curriculum. Consequently, it was revealed in one of the key findings in the recent research evidence by Mahmood et al. (2024) that a significant majority of the participants strongly recommended that including gender equality and HR in the textbooks is the dire need of the hour. Likewise, it was explicitly emphasized by Rauf et al. (2024) in their research endeavor that human rights education (HRE) is being given significant preference in including in educational policies,

curricula, and textbooks at the international level, specifically in the Asia Pacific, as it contributes positively to social transformation. However, the fact raised by Quennerstedt (2022) in her study is that there is an utter lack of research in guiding the nation states, schools, and teachers to impart HRE on strong footings in educational institutions.

The significance of making the learners cognizant of the HR issues and the undeniable benefits of their inclusion in the textbooks cannot be gainsaid. In other words, the awareness of HR through HRE can lead to a more robust foundation for security, safety, and fulfillment of the lives of individuals and their legitimate rights in society (Barton, 2019). It is, therefore, equally pertinent to bring to the limelight that investigating HR and its allied issues is a continuing concern within the textbooks. Recently, researchers have shown an increased interest in carrying out research studies to explore whether civil, political, cultural, and economic rights and the serious issues about HR have been given any due heed. Experts of HR and HRE (e.g., Akhtar, 2024; Rauf et al., 2024) used qualitative content analysis while exploring the duties and responsibilities of the citizens and the inclusion of political as well as social rights in curricula. Nevertheless, their studies were restricted to the subject of History Textbooks only in elite private schools in Punjab, Pakistan. Akhtar (2024), in his research paper, which was part of his doctoral dissertation, emphasized that Pakistan is confronted with the impediment of providing citizenship education as an independent subject to the students. It was also inferred from his findings that respect for laws was utterly lacking in Pakistan's present-day scenario. Furthermore, Rauf et al. (2024) deduced from their analytical study that there is a considerable lacuna in the true presentation of the struggles for achieving HR, ignoring the perspectives of minorities and normalizing political oppression in textbooks across the country. Therefore, there is a need to pay attention to the positive protection of HR and anti-discrimination.

Košir and Lakshminarayanan (2021; 2024), two Indian experts of HRE, carried out content analysis studies of how civil, political, cultural, and economic rights, as well as women's rights, were portrayed in the primary and secondary school social science textbooks. The researchers have drawn opposing findings from the analysis of their recent investigations. On the one hand, in their former study (Košir & Lakshminarayanan, 2021), it was revealed that more preference and significance were heeded to the recognition and cognisance of fundamental rights through HRE in the textbooks in India. They selected textbooks and the relevant courses from Environmental Studies, Social Science, Civics, Geography, History, Political Science, and Economics from grades 1 to 10. It was found that 7 textbooks had fundamental rights and duties mentioned in the Constitution of India, while 2 textbooks included the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), as was found by Košir and Lakshminarayanan (2021). However, on the other hand, their subsequent study taken up in 2024 denotes that the least preference was paid to focus on women's rights in the textbooks being taught in elementary schools in India. These researchers further stress that a wider societal transformation to achieve gender parity, and gender stereotypes, and curb the marginalization of females, is the exigency of the time. Hence, the school curriculum and the textbook contents are the most effective tools in influencing and revitalizing the approaches to respect and safeguard the rights of the relegated weaker gender of women (Košir & Lakshminarayanan, 2024). In the same manner, there are studies whose findings are not encouraging, for they reveal that HR and civil rights, in particular, along with the issues of women's rights, gender equality, racism, feminism, beliefs, and multiculturalism, have been superficially touched upon (Gürel & Avci, 2022) in the textbooks.

It is also worth mentioning that several studies (e.g., Merey, 2018; Lucy et al., 2020; Paglayan, 2022; Iqbal & Ali, 2024; Küçükbesleme et al., 2024) have been carried out across the world wherein researchers have compared two or more textbooks in different subjects through a content analysis approach while investigating HR and the related unachievable issues propped up due to flagrant violations of civil, political, cultural, and economic rights. In other words, HRE is fast becoming a key instrument in textbooks in international comparative studies. While carrying out comparative studies on exploring HRE issues in the textbooks in Turkey and the United States, it was found by Merey (2018) that the issues of peace and tolerance were given the least importance in the selected textbooks. Likewise, in the study of Lucy et al. (2020), who applied cutting-edge data science techniques the primary focus of which was probing into the issues of gender, race, and ethnicity, it was inferred that in the sampled Texas US History textbooks it was the prominent personalities of the white men who were significantly portrayed instead of a rare discussion on Latinx citizens. Furthermore, the Black community was shown to be doing odd jobs with "low agency and power" with the additional portrayal of women being restricted to "work and home". In the same vein, Paglayan (2022) examined



the issues of racial injustice and the imposed discrimination meted out to Blacks by the high-ups sitting at the helm of affairs in institutions in the context of History Textbooks between 1955 to 1975, which spanned twenty years state-approved authorities in the US. The comparison was undertaken from the selected textbooks taught in Alabama, Indiana, and California in the wake of African American empowerment as a sequel to the Civil Rights Movement in the American Continent. The main watchword of the said Movement was to despise racial difference and institutionalized injustices against which the Black activists had taken up the cudgels. It was also concluded that the authorities had been very stubborn in minimizing the history of racial despise in History Textbooks in Alabama (Paglayan, 2022). Similarly, Iqbal and Ali (2024) undertook the investigation of civil rights, followed by related issues and their positive and negative directions in the sampled textbooks by selecting key clauses from the UDHR and the Constitution of Pakistan (CoP). The investigators of the study also chose eleven issues related to civil rights. The most striking result to emerge from the data was that the issue of gender inequality was found more in SSC Textbooks in English, which was opposite to 'O' Level English. Furthermore, another worth noting finding was that the issue of race was given more weightage in 'O' Level English, which was counter-intuitive to SSC.

In the same way, Küçükbesleme et al. (2024) conducted qualitative content analysis to explore the issues of civil, cultural, economic, and political rights in two EFL course books, Count Me In and Notifier, being used in Turkish high schools. They also stressed in their study that the world is confronted with the issues of poverty and hunger, which have dire aftermaths both on the planet and for humanity. Consequently, UNESCO (2017) initiated its plan under the name, "Sustainable Development Goals" to take prompt action and tackle the civil rights issues of gender equality, reduced inequality and peace, justice and strong institutions to wipe off the evils of slavery, hatred based on belief and religion, discrimination, torture treatment and heinous violation of human HR that are gnawing at human society at its roots. The findings of the research endeavor also denoted that thirteen HR issues were commonly addressed in the EFL course books in Turkey (Küçükbesleme et al., 2024).

Although the cited studies are of inimitable contributions in the comparative studies of probing deep into the issues of HR in textbooks across the world, two of these studies were conducted on the subjects of Social Studies through comparative analysis in Turkey and the US and EFL course books within Turkey (Merey, 2018; Küçükbesleme et al., 2024); two were carried out in the US in the subject of History (Lucy et al., 2020; Paglayan, 2022) and just one in English textbooks in Pakistan in KP (Iqbal & Ali, 2024). Hence, there is a need to look into the issues of civil rights in the subject of Urdu.

Furthermore, previous attempts undertaken by the experts in the field of HR and HRE in extracting the issue of HR in the textbooks at the international level have also been carried out, which have explicit implications on the existing literature, yet their contexts are different. For instance, Rinaldi and Marina (2024) undertook the curricula of a foreign language in Ukraine and Switzerland; Jimenez et al. (2017) selected the textbooks of Social Studies, Civics, Geography, and History from Africa, Arab States: Asia and the Pacific: Europe and North-America and Latin America and the Caribbean; Bromley (2014) compared minority and HR analysis in 501 high schools social science textbooks in 67 countries which were published from 1970 to 2008 spanning over 38 years; Helland (2011) investigated the portrayal of HR and environmental issues in American and Norwegian High School curricula and Textbooks and Aslan and Karaman-Kepenekci (2008) explored HR issues of freedom, democracy, justice, tolerance, and peace in the mother tongue textbooks in Turkey and France. Hence, it can be deduced from the previously existing body of literature that to date, no study has been identified in exploring the issue of civil rights in the subject of Urdu language in KP, Pakistan, in a comparative content analysis at SSC versus 'O' Level Cambridge University.

This paper examined the issues of civil rights as mentioned in UDHR and CoP by adopting a qualitative comparative content analysis design in Urdu Textbooks of Cambridge Assessment International Education (CAIE) and SSC level, which were taught in schools in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. This particular analytical content design was chosen to probe deep into the issues of civil rights and their inclusion in the selected textbooks. The logic behind applying qualitative comparative analysis is that it is significantly used in educational research to investigate complex phenomena of cause and effect through the application of qualitative data (Bingham et al., 2019).



Statement of the Problem

Experts and human rights activists are of the notion that human rights, as have been emphasized in the key declarations and significant conventions of the United Nations, and the fundamental rights chapter given in the constitutions of the leading states, need to be included in the textbooks and be inculcated in the minds of the students through formal teachings in schools to make them responsible citizens. Nonetheless, in the humanities subjects, particularly in Urdu textbooks in Pakistan and with specific reference to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, there is a dearth of human rights education. Therefore, the purpose of this qualitative research was to investigate issues about civil rights as highlighted in the UDHR and CoP in the textbooks of Urdu in the SSC versus the Cambridge 'O' Level.

Research Question

To what extent do the issues of civil rights exist in the textbooks of Urdu in the SSC versus 'O' Level streams?

Delimitations

This research endeavor was delimited to:

- ▶ All those clauses of UDHR and CoP that highlight the issues related to civil rights only
- ▶ Being the national language of Pakistan, the subject of Urdu carries cardinal importance in the medium of instruction and teaching-learning activities. Hence, the investigators of the present study delimited it to the Urdu textbook of 'O' Level, “نگارستانِ اردو ادب” and Urdu compulsory for class 10th published by Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Textbook Board, Peshawar, for the years 2019 and 2020.
- ▶ Taking all generations of human rights mentioned both in UDHR and CoP was out of the scope of the current investigation. Consequently, the present research was further restricted only to issues about civil rights within the prose sections of Urdu textbooks of both strands.

Methodology

Research Design

The fundamental aim of any research, particularly qualitative investigation, is to probe deep into capturing the rich experiences, beliefs, and perspectives of the individuals, which enable the investigators to create new vistas of knowledge (Lim, 2024). Nevertheless, the application of apposite research design and rich knowledge of relevant research philosophy is equally but inevitably necessary for the researchers to carry out coherent and effective research endeavors (Kamal, 2019). The researchers, therefore, adopted a qualitative design in nature that explored the issues of civil rights as enshrined in UDHR and CoP in SSC versus 'O' Level Urdu Textbooks.

Population

In qualitative research, specifically in content analysis, population refers to the entire stuff in the form of texts, images, or any written communication, whether in prose or poetry form, to which the generalization of the results is directly applicable (Drisko & Maschi, 2016; Fraenkel & Wallen, 1993). Nevertheless, all the lessons, units, and pages of the two textbooks of the Urdu language in both streams comprised the population of the study (Fraenkel & Wallen, 2012).

Table 1

Population of the Study

Book	Total Units	Total Pages
SSC Urdu Compulsory for Class 10th اردو لازمی برائے جماعت دہم - خیبر پختونخوا ٹیکسٹ بک بورڈ، پشاور	11	95
Urdu Textbook of 'O' Level ”نگارستانِ اردو ادب”	16	217

Table 1 above reveals a brief overview of the target population. The SSC Urdu Compulsory Textbook consisted of 11 units with 95 pages altogether; on the other hand, the Urdu Textbook of 'O' Level comprised 16 units with 217 pages.



Sample

Researchers have equally emphasized that the quality and validation of research findings are proximity with the right selection of both population and sampling techniques (Timamah et al., 2025). Since the population of the entire text was too large to be analyzed simultaneously, therefore, the investigators had to restrict their approach to a reasonable body of text (Krippendorff, 2004). Hence, it is pertinent to highlight that the study under investigation was essentially based on an analytical approach; therefore, the researchers adopted convenient and purposive sampling. The rationale behind these two samples was that they are broadly used as non-probability samplings (Stratton, 2021; Ahmad & Wilkins, 2024) in qualitative comparative content analysis research due to their easy accessibility, availability, and deliberate selection for serving the intentional purpose.

Table 2

Selected Sample of SSC Compulsory Textbook for Class 10th

Subject	Chapter/ Unit/Lesson	Total Pages	Total Paragraphs	Total Sentences	Total Sentences Selected	Total Sentences Dropped
اردو لازمی جماعت دہم	سبق نمبر: ۰۳ علامہ اقبال کا تصور وطنیت	04	09	36	34	02
	سبق نمبر: ۰۷: ناندیو مانی	05	16	71	57	14
Total	02	09	25	107	91	16

Table ۲ denotes that the investigators chose two lessons named, “علامہ اقبال کا تصور وطنیت” and “ناندیو مانی” by applying both convenient and purposive sampling from the Urdu compulsory for class 10th published by Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Textbook Board, Peshawar, for the years 2019 and 2020. The selected lessons contained 9 pages with 25 paragraphs, which were followed by a total of 107 sentences in both lessons in toto. Nonetheless, only 91 sentences having direct immediacy with fundamental human rights were chosen. Whereas 16 sentences were excluded from the selection pool as they had no link to the issues of civil rights.

Table 3

Selected Sample of 'O' Level Compulsory Textbook

Subject	Chapter/ Unit/Lesson	Total Pages	Total Paragraphs	Total Sentences	Total Sentences Selected	Total Sentences Dropped
نگارستانِ اردو ادب	سبق نمبر: ۰۲: مہل اور میں	04	03	80	36	44
	سبق نمبر: ۰۳: کنڈ کٹر	09	96	175	46	129
Total	02	13	99	255	82	173

Table 4 reveals that the investigators selected just two lessons under the names “مہل اور میں” and “کنڈ کٹر” from the Urdu textbook of 'O' Level called “نگارستانِ اردو ادب” through both convenient and purposive samplings. The selected lessons included 13 pages that further comprised 99 paragraphs. There were 255 sentences in total, out of which 82 sentences were selected, and 173 were dropped as they were irrelevant to civil rights issues.

Data Collection Tool

Data collection is the procedure of collecting the data, whether primary or secondary, to delve deep into a research problem under investigation (Taherdoost, 2021). Since content analysis is primarily related to secondary data, therefore, it is usually collected from published sources. In other words, the data is already available in printed form and can be utilized for some other purpose in different contexts (Armann-Keown & Patterson, 2020; Taherdoost, 2021). Likewise, Zhang and Wildemuth (2009) have extensively delved into content analysis to be an important research tool to observe the presence of specific words, themes, constructs, or concepts, patterns, and trends in a given data, such as text. They have further elaborated that through this widely used approach the presence, implicit and explicit meanings and relationships of the words, themes, and concepts are being analyzed and quantified. In



addition, the investigators are then able to infer the underlying meanings within the texts, the culture and the time surrounding the text under consideration, and the cultural, social, and even moral ethos lying scattered. Furthermore, the text under investigation needs to be broken down into a manageable size, which in other words is termed as codes. Codes can then be grouped into categories that culminate into themes (Kohlbacher, 2006). However, it is pertinent to highlight that the investigators applied the model of Shukla (2011), previously developed by her, which was also used by Iqbal & Ali (2024) and Abouzar et al. (2020) in their research studies.

Table 4*Modified version of the Model of Shukla (2011) for Data Collection*

Name	Nature	Total
Issues selected from the CP and UDHR with Articles Mentioned	[CoP Article 9] Security of a Person, [CoP Article 10] Safeguards in Arrest and Detention, [CoP Article 10 A] Fair trial, [CoP Article 11] Slavery, [CoP Article 12] Retrospective punishment, [CoP Article 13] Self – incrimination, [CoP Article 14] Dignity, [UDHR Article 5] Torture and Degrading Treatment, [UDHR Article 12] Interference with Privacy, Family, Home and Correspondence, [UDHR Article 2] Religious Issues, Race, Cast, Gender, Freedom from Discrimination, [CoP Article 25] Right to equality before the law	11

Table 4 denotes a slight modification of Shukla's (2011) model of data collection about human rights. The investigators selected 11 issues from the clauses of UDHR, which were 08 having similarity with the chosen provisions of CoP, resulting in 04 in total. The unit of analysis was just one complete sentence from which the researchers inferred the existence of the issues of security of a person, safeguards in arrest and detention, fair trial, slavery, retrospective punishment, self – incrimination, dignity, torture, and degrading treatment, interference with privacy, family, home and correspondence, religious issues, race, cast, gender, freedom from discrimination and right to equality before the law.

Data Analysis

Table 5

Comparative content analysis of issues of human rights in Urdu compulsory for class 10th and Urdu textbook of 'O' Level, “نگارستانِ اردو ادب”

S. No	Issues	SSC Urdu F	Percentage	'O' Level Urdu F	Percentage
1	Security of a Person	02	13.33%	00	00%
2	Safeguards in Arrest and Detention	00	00%	00	00%
3	Trail	00	00%	00	00%
4	Slavery	00	00%	01	6.66%
5	Punishment	00	00%	00	00%
6	Self – incrimination	00	00%	00	00%
7	Dignity	01	6.66%	00	00%
8	Torture and Degrading Treatment	00	00%	03	15
9	Interference with Privacy, Family, Home and Correspondence	00	00%	00	00%
10	Religion Issues of Civil Rights	00	00%	00	00%
11	Race	17	83.33%	00	00%
12	Cast	00	00%	00	00%
13	Gender	00	00%	08	40%
14	Freedom from Discrimination	00	00%	08	40 %
15	Right to equality before the law	00	00%	00	00%
Total	15	20	100%	20	100%



Table 5 highlights a comparative analysis of issues of human rights in the Urdu compulsory for class 10th and the Urdu textbook of 'O' Level, "نگارستانِ اردو" as mentioned in CoP and UDHR. Data collected shows that in the SSC Urdu textbook the issues of security of a person with $f = 02$ having 13.33 %, dignity with $f = 01$ having 6.66%, race with $f = 17$ having 83.33% out of the total = 91 sentences accordingly which were > than 'O' Level Urdu with $f = 00$ having 00%, $f = 00$ having 00%, $f = 00$ having 00% out of the total = 82 selected sentence accordingly. Whereas, in 'O' Level Urdu the issues of slavery with $f = 01$ having 6.66%, torture and degrading treatment with $f = 03$ having 15%, gender with $f = 19$ having 40% were found more out of the total selected sentences = 82 respectively which were > than Urdu SSC textbook with $f = 00$ having 00%, $f = 00$ having 00%, $f = 00$ having 00%, $f = 00$ having 00%, $f = 00$ having 00 out of total = 92 sentences selected. Ironically, it was found that issues of safeguards in arrest and detention, trial, punishment, self – incrimination, interference with privacy, family, home and correspondence, religious issues of civil rights, cast, right to equality before the law in both of SSC and 'O' level Urdu textbooks completely ignored which was with $f = 00$ having 00 % out of the selected sentences.

In the list below are the excerpts of key issues of human rights found to be more in SSC and 'O' Level Urdu textbooks.

Evidence of issue of race having the highest frequency in SSC Urdu textbook:

- ▶ کیونکہ اسلام بنی نوع انسان کی وہ وحدت ہے جو رنگ و نسل و زبان سے بالاتر ہے۔ (اردو لازمی جماعت دہم: سبق کا نام علامہ اقبال کا تصور وطنیت: مصنف: ڈاکٹر وحید قریشی، صفحہ: ۲۲، پیرا گراف: ۰۱، جملہ: ۰۴)۔
- ▶ Islam is the unity of mankind that transcends color, race, and language. (Urdu Compulsory Class 10: Lesson Name: Allama Iqbal's Concept of Nationality: Author: Dr. Waheed Qureshi, page: 22, paragraph: 02, sentence: 04).

Evidence of issue of gender having the highest frequency in 'O' Level Urdu textbook:

- ▶ عورت اور مرد کی مساوات کے قائل تو ضرور تھے تاہم اپنے خیالات میں اور بعض اوقات اپنے رویے میں ہم کبھی نہ کبھی اس کی تکذیب ضرور کر دیتے تھے۔ (کیمرج اولیول فرسٹ لیگنویج اردو، سبق کا نام: میل اور میں، مصنف: سید احمد شاہ بطرس بخاری، صفحہ: ۵۲، ج پیرا گراف: ۰۱، جملہ: ۱۱)۔
- ▶ We certainly believed in the equality of men and women, but in our thoughts and sometimes in our behavior, we denied it. (Cambridge 'O' Level First Language Urdu, Lesson Title: Mabel and Me, Author: Syed Ahmad Shah Patras Bukhari, page: 52, paragraph: 01, sentence: 11).

Discussion

The basic purpose of this research inquiry was to dig out key issues of civil rights according to the chosen clauses of UDHR and Cop in the textbooks of Urdu Language in SSC versus 'O' Level in KP. The most striking finding is that the issue of race was found more in SSC Urdu, which is contrary to the 'O' Level, where it was completely ignored. It seems possible that this result is because the primary aim of the writer of the lesson was to emphasize more on racial equality in Islam, which was the prime motto of the philosophy of Allama Iqbal and his concept of patriotism in the selected lesson. This study supports evidence from previous observations (e.g., Mikander, 2023; Bowen & Hopper, 2023; Bernabé & Martínez-Bello, 2021). Two more significant findings that stand out from the results are the issues of gender and freedom from discrimination that were given more weightage in 'O' Level Urdu, in contrast to SSC. An alternative explanation for these results is that it is because the primary themes of the selected lessons from "نگارستانِ اردو" were based on gender and freedom from racial discrimination. However, these results were not very encouraging. These derived findings may be biased due to the small sample, the subjectivity of the researchers in the interpretation of data, biases in coding, and difficulties in capturing the contextual meanings of the words and sentences according to prominent experts (e.g. Berg, 2001; Krippendorff, 2004; Fraenkel & Wallen, 2012; Bradford & Cullen, 2017; Manimozhi & Srinivasan, 2018) of content analysis.

Limitations of the Study

This current study was limited by the small sample size of a convenience and purposive sample. Hence, the generalizability of these results may not apply to large-scale research. Similarly, this research investigation was limited by the absence of the latest software of NVIVO; therefore, data were analyzed manually by the investigators. Likewise, the present study is based on a small selection of only two lessons from each stratum of SSC versus 'O' Level. Nevertheless, the findings suggest that teachers teaching the key humanities subjects of Urdu, English, Islamic, and



Social Studies need to make the students aware of the most important issues of rights to life, liberty, personal security, equality, religion, race, cast, and freedom from discrimination to achieve the right to equality in alma mater in matters in both letter and spirit.

Implications & Future Research

The findings of the study might further indicate that the scope of the present comparative content analysis needs to be extended to different contexts and streams of education elsewhere. The present research endeavor may open fresh insights for the researchers to explore other prominent issues in economic, social, and cultural rights in the key compulsory books at the secondary level. In the same vein, the results of this qualitative research suggest that decision-makers, curriculum planning wings, and the concerned textbook boards of both SSC and 'O' Level have to give due consideration to focus primarily on including civil, cultural, political, and economic rights along with the allied issues as has been highlighted in Cop in the textbooks of humanities subjects across KP on a priority basis. Similarly, there is abundant room for further studies in investigating human rights at higher secondary schools and 'A' Level elsewhere.

Conclusion

This study set out to investigate the most debatable issues of civil rights as mentioned either implicitly or explicitly in the UDHR and the CoP titled as fundamental rights. It was restricted by carrying out a comparative content analysis of Urdu Textbooks in SSC and 'O' Level in KP. This research has found that the issue of race has been significantly highlighted in the SSC stream in comparison to the 'O' Level. On the other hand, gender and freedom from discrimination were more in the 'O' Level instead of the SSC Urdu Textbook. Furthermore, the insights gained from this investigation may be of assistance to the key stakeholders of both streams to address the overlooked issues of civil rights not only in the subject of Urdu but also in English, Islamic Studies, and Social Studies textbooks in the future. In addition, the study lays the groundwork for future comparative content analysis research into investigating cultural, political, and economic rights in the existing heterogeneous systems of education across Pakistan in general and KP in particular.



References

- Abouzar, M., Shehzad, S., & Ali, R. (2020). The Content Analysis of Class 10th English Text Book in Post-Conflict Peace Building Process in District Swat. *International Review of Social Sciences (IRSS)*, 8, 262-278.
- Ahmad, M., & Wilkins, S. (2025). Purposive sampling in qualitative research: A framework for the entire journey. *Quality & Quantity*, 59(2), 1461-1479. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-024-02022-5>
- Akhtar, M. (2024). Examining the Concepts of Citizenship Duties and Responsibilities in Elite School Curriculum in Pakistan: An Analysis of Citizenship Education Related Textbooks. *Journal of Interdisciplinary Educational Studies*, 4(2), 1-15.
- Ali, R., & Hussain, L. (2019). Gender representation in primary level English and Urdu textbooks in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Applied Social Sciences*, 10(1), 83-100. <https://doi.org/10.46568/pjass.v10i1.102>
- Armann-Keown, V., & Patterson, L. (2020). Content analysis in library and information research: An analysis of trends. *Library & Information Science Research*, 42(4), 101048. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lisr.2020.101048>
- Aslan, C., & Karaman-Kepenekci, Y. (2008). *Human rights education: A comparison of mother tongue textbooks in Turkey and France*. Euro-Mediterranean Centre for Educational Research.
- Barton, K. C. (2019). What should we teach about human rights? Implications of international research. *Social Education*, 83(4), 212-216.
- Berg, B. L. (2001). *QUALITATIVE RESEARCH METHODS FOR THE SOCIAL SCIENCES 4th*. Allyn and bacon.
- Bernabé, M. D. M., & Martinez-Bello, V. (2021). Evolution of racism in Spanish music textbooks: a real path towards interculturality through images?. *Journal for Multicultural Education*, 15(3), 313-329. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JME-05-2021-0062>
- Bingham, A. J., Dean, S., & Castillo, J. (2019). Qualitative comparative analysis in educational policy research: Procedures, processes, and possibilities. *Methodological Innovations*, 12(2). <https://doi.org/10.1177/2059799119840982>
- Bowen, N. E., & Hopper, D. (2022). The representation of race in English language learning textbooks: Inclusivity and equality in images. *TESOL Quarterly*, 57(4), 1013-1040. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.3169>
- Bradford, S. & Cullen, F. (2017). *Research and Research Methods for Youth Practitioners*. Routledge Taylor and Francis Group.
- Bromley, P. (2014). Comparing minority and human rights discourse in social science textbooks: Cross-national patterns, 1970-2008. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 39(1), 1-44. <https://doi.org/10.29173/cjs17001>
- Drisko, J. W., & Maschi, T. (2016). *Content analysis*. Oxford University Press.
- Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (2012). *How to design and evaluate education research* (Vol. 7, p. 429). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Fraenkel, J., Wallen, N., & Hyun, H. (1993). *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education*, 10th ed. McGraw-Hill Education.
- Gürel, D., & Avcı, G. (2022). Social studies textbooks in Turkey in terms of citizenship and human rights: a critical discourse analysis: Social studies textbooks in terms of citizenship and human rights. *International Journal of Curriculum and Instruction*, 14(2), 1600-1628. <https://www.ijci.net/index.php/IJCI/article/view/980>
- Helland, T. (2011). *Representation of human rights and environmental issues in American and Norwegian high school curricula and textbooks—A comparative study*. American University.
- Iqbal, J., & Ali, R. (2024). Investigating Human Rights Education in Curricula: A Comparative Content Analysis of O'Level Versus SSC English Textbooks. *International Journal of Social Science Archives (IJSSA)*, 7(3). <https://www.ijssa.com/index.php/ijssa/article/view/403>
- Jimenez, J. D., Lerch, J., & Bromley, P. (2017). Education for global citizenship and sustainable development in social science textbooks. *European Journal of Education*, 52(4), 460-476. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12240>
- Kamal, S. S. L. B. A. (2019). Research paradigm and the philosophical foundations of a qualitative study. *PEOPLE: International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(3), 1386-1394. <https://doi.org/10.20319/pijss.2019.43.13861394>
- Kohlbacher, F. (2006). *The use of qualitative content analysis in case study research*. In *Forum qualitative sozialforschung/forum: Qualitative social research* (Vol. 7, No. 1, pp. 1-30). Institut für Klinische Psychologie und Gemeindesychologie.



- Košir, S., & Lakshminarayanan, R. (2021). Inclusion of 'generations of human rights' in social science textbooks. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 80, 102295. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2020.102295>
- Košir, S., & Lakshminarayanan, R. (2024). Manifestation of women's rights in school textbooks? Evidence from social science textbooks in India. *Human Rights Review*, 25(3), 317-337. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12142-024-00726-7>
- Krippendorff, K. (2004). Reliability in content analysis: Some common misconceptions and recommendations. *Human communication research*, 30(3), 411-433. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2958.2004.tb00738.x>
- Küçükbesleme, K. N., Erko, B. N., Dertli, S., & Özcan, E. (2024). The Representation of Human Rights in Local EFL Coursebooks. *Humanising Language Teaching*, 26(5).
- Lim, W. M. (2025). What is qualitative research? An overview and guidelines. *Australasian Marketing Journal*, 33(2), 199-229. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14413582241264619>
- Lucy, L., Demszy, D., Bromley, P., & Jurafsky, D. (2020). Content analysis of textbooks via natural language processing: Findings on gender, race, and ethnicity in Texas US history textbooks. *AERA Open*, 6(3), 2332858420940312. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2332858420940312>
- Mahmood, A., Shahzadi, A., & Anwar, K. (2024). Students and teachers perception about gender equality and human rights in English textbook (Pakistan). *Journal of Asian Development Studies*, 13(2), 580-594. <https://doi.org/10.62345/jads.2024.13.2.47>
- Manimozhi, G., & Srinivasan, P. (2018). A meta synthesis of content analysis approaches. *American Journal of Educational Research*, 6(6), 632-637.
- Merey, Z. (2018). A comparison of human rights education in social studies textbooks in Turkey and the United States. *International Journal of Progressive Education*, 14(6), 18-37. <https://doi.org/10.29329/ijpe.2018.179.2>
- Mikander, P. (2023). Racism in Finnish school textbooks: Developments and discussions. In *Finland's famous education system: Unvarnished insights into Finnish schooling* (pp. 289-302). Singapore: Springer Nature Singapore.
- Naeem, M. (2024). Discourse of Social Inequality and Race in Urdu Novel *اردو ناول میں سماجی عدم مساوات اور نسل کا* (اردو ناول میں سماجی عدم مساوات اور نسل کا). (34), 19-5. (Tahqeeq Nama.19-5, (34), (کلامیہ).
- Paglayan, A. (2022). *Education as Social Control: Evidence from School Textbooks after the Civil Rights Movement*.
- Quennerstedt, A. (2022). Children's and young people's human rights education in school: Cardinal complications and a middle ground. *Journal of Human Rights*, 21(4), 383-398. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14754835.2021.2014795>
- Rahman, A. U., Muhammad, G., & Jan, A. R. (2022). An analysis of grade-viii English textbook with gender disparity perspectives in the curriculum of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *Journal of Social Sciences Review*, 2(1), 32-55. <https://doi.org/10.54183/jssr.v2i1.23>
- Rashid, H. U., Shah, A. A., & Sarwar, M. (2023). Analysis of Teaching Human Rights Values at University Level in Pakistan. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 45(1), 1-22.
- Rauf, A., Muhammad, Y., & Yousaf, A. (2024). Centering marginalized voices: Examining political and social rights in Pakistani elite school textbooks. *International Journal of Social Science & Entrepreneurship*, 4(2).
- Rinaldi, S., & Marina, O. (2024). Learning how to speak truth to power – comparing Ukrainian and Swiss foreign language curricula. *Human Rights Education Review*, 7(1), 49-71. <https://doi.org/10.7577/hrer.5272>
- Stratton, S. J. (2021). Population research: Convenience sampling strategies. *Prehospital and Disaster Medicine*, 36(4), 373-374. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s1049023x21000649>
- Taherdoost, H. (2025). Data collection techniques in qualitative research. *Navigating Qualitative Research*, 1-36. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003616412-1>
- Timamah, I., Sa'diyah, H., Munawarah, F., & Jannah, F. (2025). The important role of population and samples in educational research. *Demagogi: Journal of Social Sciences, Economics and Education*, 3(1), 55-66. <https://doi.org/10.61166/demagogi.v3i1.66>
- UNESCO (2017). *UNESCO is moving forward with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*. UNESCO. <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000247785>
- Zhang, Y., & Wildemuth, B. M. (2009). Qualitative analysis of content. *Applications of social research methods to questions in information and library science*, 308(319), 1-12.

